Writers Workshop Unit of Study
7th Grade – Writing the Argument

ELA
Common
Core
Standards

Proposal Essay
Writers Workshop Unit of Study  
7th Grade – Writing the Argument  
Table of Contents

**Preface**
- Learning Progression, Grades 6-8 ................................................................. 1
- Learning Progression, Grades 9-12 ................................................................. 3

**Background Section**
- Abstract ............................................................................................................ 7
- Standards .......................................................................................................... 9
- Overview of Sessions – Teaching Points and Unit Assessments ...................... 11
- Informational Essay Rubric ............................................................................. 13

**Resource Materials Section**
Resource Materials needed for each session follow the table of the Overview of that Session
- Session 1 .......................................................................................................... 14
- Session 2 & 3 .................................................................................................. 22
- Session 4 & 5 .................................................................................................. 30
- Session 6 & 7 .................................................................................................. 41
- Session 8 ......................................................................................................... 49
- Session 9 ......................................................................................................... 54
- Session 10 ...................................................................................................... 59
- Session 11 & 12 ............................................................................................. 64
- Session 13 - 15 .............................................................................................. 65
- Session 16 - 18 .............................................................................................. 66
Writers Workshop Unit of Study  
7th Grade – Writing the Argument  
Preface

The following unit supports and aligns to the Common Core State Standards. This research-based work is the outcome of a collective effort made by numerous secondary teachers from around the state of Michigan. Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators (MAISA) initiated a statewide collaborative project, bringing together educators from around the state to create and refine a K-12 English Language Arts model curriculum. This one unit is situated within a yearlong sequence of units. Depending upon the unit’s placement in the yearlong scope and sequence, it will be important to recognize prior skills and content this unit expects learners to have. Each unit presents a string of teaching points that scaffold and spiral the content and skills. The unit is structured to be student centered rather than teacher driven. Sessions emphasize student engagement and strive to increase critical thinking and writing skills simultaneously. Writing and thinking processes are stressed and are equally important to the end writing product. Sessions are designed as a series of mini-lessons that allow time to write, practice, and conference. Through summative and formative assessments specific to each unit, students will progress toward becoming independent thinkers and writers.

Significant input and feedback was gathered both in the initial conceptualizing of the unit and later revisions. Teachers from around the state piloted and/or reviewed the unit, and their feedback and student artifacts helped in the revision process. Special thanks go to lead unit writer Delia DeCourcy, who closely studied the CCSS, translated the standards into curriculum and practice, and revised with a close eye to classroom teacher feedback. Throughout the yearlong collaborative project, teachers reviewing units are finding how students’ habits of mind have shifted from task-oriented to big-picture thinking, utilizing a critical literacy lens.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Middle School Argument Writing Unit Learning Progression</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Text</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Make &amp; Support a Claim</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentor texts: paragraphs and essays by students about year-round school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Generating Ideas for Argument Writing</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understand the concepts of claim and evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Understand the prompt and pre-write to discover and narrow a claim.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Creating/Planning</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Search for evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Examine evidence to generate a claim.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Drafting</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Support the claim with evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cite sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Generate commentary to explain how the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Revising and Editing | evidence supports the claim. | piece of evidence.  
- Experiment with block and alternating paragraph structures.  
- Create transitions between sentences to improve flow and logic.  
- Develop a topic sentence that combines claim and a summary of the evidence. |
|----------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| **Revising and Editing** | - Examine the persuasiveness of the claim and evidence.  
- Reconsider the organization of the evidence.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling.  
- Reflect on the process to learn from the experience.  
- Publish for an authentic audience. | - Revise content and structure.  
- Edit for grammar feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. |
| | - Provide and receive constructive feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. | - Provide and receive constructive feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. |
| | - Revise content and structure.  
- Edit for grammar (fragments and run-ons) and spelling.  
- Reflect on the process to learn from the experience.  
- Publish for an authentic audience. | - Revise content and structure.  
- Edit for grammar (commas and dashes) and spelling.  
- Reflect on the process to learn from the experience.  
- Publish for an authentic audience. |
| | - Provide and receive constructive feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. | - Provide and receive constructive feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. |
| | - Revise content and structure.  
- Edit for grammar feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. | - Revise content and structure.  
- Edit for grammar (commas and dashes) and spelling.  
- Reflect on the process to learn from the experience.  
- Publish for an authentic audience. |
| | - Provide and receive constructive feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. | - Provide and receive constructive feedback.  
- Reconsider evidence.  
- Try different organizational strategies.  
- Edit for grammar and spelling. |
| | - Revise content and structure.  
- Edit for grammar (fragments and run-ons) and spelling.  
- Reflect on the process to learn from the experience.  
- Publish for an authentic audience. | - Revise content and structure.  
- Edit for grammar (commas and dashes) and spelling.  
- Reflect on the process to learn from the experience.  
- Publish for an authentic audience. |
| Learning Progressions for High School Argumentative Writing: Basics of Argumentation |
|---------------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| **Text** | **Focus** | **9th Grade** | **10th Grade** | **11th Grade** |
| Advertisements | Media and Marketing | Connect prior knowledge about the persuasion in these ways: 1. Consumers are bombarded with arguments that may seem invisible. 2. Products are marketed for their real and perceived values. 3. Define methods and sub-genres in the field of marketing and advertisement. | Review prior knowledge about the basics of argument. 1. Argument is a basic of daily life. 2. People encounter argumentative claims in daily living: news, reading, conversation, online blogs. 3. Elements: claim, evidence, counterclaims, and explanation. | Engage in reading the world as a reflective observer, constructing facts and claims about the ways we acquire or use power in social settings. |
| Film | Social Issues in Film | Read film as an argumentative text to become a critical citizen, studying and voicing opinions about problems that create concerns for society. 1. Identify the multiple claims in a film, exploring/exposing various aspects of a social or political issue. 2. Identify a claim of personal interest and collect evidence from the film to support the claim. 3. Study the elements of film critique to prepare for writing an argumentative film critique. | Engage in conversations with others who study power in social settings. Compare and propose issues that matter and actions that might be considered. |
| Primary Research | Power in Social Settings | Explore evidence after reflecting on information gathered from reading about power. Focus and clarify multiple angles or claims that might be taken from the evidence. | Engage in conversations with others who study power in social settings. Compare and propose issues that matter and actions that might be considered. |

**Exploring Ideas—Generating, Planning, and Drafting**

- Inquire through search and reflection to identify the stances or positions advertisers use to persuade buyers. Consider persuasion for both impulse and planned consumerism.
- Collect and analyze evidence to develop and support claims about effective methods used by advertisers.
- Compare and analyze methods used by various advertisements.
- Develop a claim based on evidence collected through exploration of marketing methods, purposes, and effectiveness of advertisements.
- Research the social issue and claim of personal interest to identify the valid and invalid evidence used in the film.
- Develop a claim about the effectiveness of the film's portrayal and defense of a social issue.
- Collect and evaluate evidence to support a claim.
- Organize the key points, evidence, reasons and explanations to develop a line of reasoning that will convince a reader and support the claim.
- Identify a single claim that seems most interesting based on evidence gathered through primary and secondary research.
- Organize the evidence to develop a line of reasoning, planning the structure and transitions in the essay.
- Write a first draft, utilizing the basic elements of an argumentative essay: claim, counterclaim, evidence and explanation.
| Focus an essay by developing multiple claims to anticipate alternate views or counterclaims. |
| Identify relevant evidence, reasons and explanations. |
| Plan an argumentative essay based on research. |
| Write a first draft using a variety of evidence to convince a reader. |

**Developing Ideas—Revising and Editing**

- Revise by outlining and annotating a first draft to identify the elements of an argument: claim, counterclaim, evidence (a variety), and explanation.
- Evaluate explanation and insert or rethink the explanation to:
  1. connect the explanation to the evidence.
  2. increase the clarity of the explanation.
  3. increase the validity of the argument
- Revise by rereading, and identify the academic/topical vocabulary used in the essay. Insert or thread “insider” language used by advertisers into the essay.
- Edit using a checklist of common errors that might include: spelling, punctuation, control of syntax, sentence variety.

- Trace the diction to identify methods of appeal, and trace diction to reduce and control emotional appeal and develop logical appeal and tone.
- Revisit the conclusion to clarify and extend the argument, utilizing research on the issue to extend the essay into new thinking.
- Edit for sentence variety, considering punctuation present in more sophisticated sentence structures.

- Revise the order and structure of the essay to:
  1. make connections.
  2. identify and repair diction.
  3. identify and repair evidence, considering validity and bias.
  4. create a logical relationship between evidence, claims, counterclaims, and explanation.
  5. increase clarity and reasoning.
  6. trace diction to identify methods of appeal, and trace diction to reduce and control emotional appeal and develop logical appeal and tone.
- Edit words, punctuation, sentences, correcting for common errors.
- Develop sentence variety to engage a reader.
| Learning Progressions for High School Argumentative Writing: Argumentative Genres |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|                               | 9th Grade                       | 10th Grade      | 11th Grade      |
| **Genre**                     | Personal Essay                  | Op-Ed           | Editorial       |
| **Becoming a Critical Reader of Argument** | • Connect prior knowledge about personal narratives to personal essays.  
1. Writers of personal narratives create a plot line by organizing stories into a sequential story line, which enables readers to make connections and inferences to identify the central idea or theme.  
2. Writers of personal essays create a line of reasoning by organizing stories of personal experience with other types of evidence to support a claim.  
• Trace a line of reasoning in a personal essay to connect the claim, evidence (personal stories), comments (explanation), and counterclaims.  
• Annotate personal essays to notice and name the elements of argumentative essays. | • Engage in reading about the world to become a critical citizen, studying and voicing opinions about problems that create concerns for society.  
• Study the genre of op-ed articles to develop a menu of writing decisions that will allow for a successful op-ed in a multi-draft writing process.  
• Identify the audience of the article and author bias to evaluate the validity of an author’s argument.  
• Engage in conversations with peers about world issues and propose actions that can improve these issues.  
• Evaluate op-eds to determine which article is most effective. | • Engage in reading about the world to become a critical citizen, studying and voicing opinions about problems that create concerns for society.  
• Study the genre of editorial articles to develop a menu of writing decisions that will enable a successful editorial in a multi-draft writing process.  
• Identify the audience of the article and author bias to evaluate the validity of an author’s argument.  
• Engage in conversations with peers about world issues and propose actions that can improve these issues.  
• Evaluate editorials to determine which article is most effective. |
| **Exploring Ideas—Generating, Planning, and Drafting** | • Explore an idea or topic in various ways:  
 o positive and negative emotions connected to an idea or topic  
 o personal dialogue to explore various beliefs on an idea or topic  
 o collection of stories that illustrates a belief  
 o multiple angles to discover new thinking  
• Read mentor texts to study how essays connect.  
• Identify evidence to support a belief.  
• Experiment with a variety of structures | • Develop a habit of reading and responding to the world to identify conflicts and their impact on individuals. Use this habit to create an inquiry on a topic/problem/issue of personal interest.  
• Explore a topic of interest to see it from multiple angles and perspectives.  
• Engage in primary and secondary research to gather information about the topic of interest.  
• Experiment with a variety of elements to structure and develop a line of reasoning.  
• Write a first draft using a repertoire of writing decisions (craft and structure). | • Develop a habit of reading and responding to the world to identify conflicts and their impact on individuals. Use this habit to create an inquiry on a topic/problem/issue of personal interest.  
• Explore a topic of interest to see it from multiple angles and perspectives.  
• Engage in primary and secondary research to gather information about the topic of interest.  
• Experiment with a variety of elements to structure and develop a line of reasoning.  
• Write a first draft using a repertoire of writing decisions (craft and structure). |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Developing Ideas—Revising and Editing</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>to develop a line of reasoning in order to write a first draft.</td>
<td>decisions (craft and structure).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Revise the order and structure of the essay to create a line of reasoning that creates a logical relationship between evidence, claims, counterclaims, and explanation.</td>
<td>● Revise the order and structure of the essay to create a line of reasoning that creates a logical relationship between evidence, claims, counterclaims, and explanation.</td>
<td>● Revise the order and structure of the essay to create a line of reasoning that creates a logical relationship between evidence, claims, counterclaims, and explanation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Reflect on the decisions that develop a focus, controlling idea, and logical development of the argument.</td>
<td>● Reflect on the decisions you have made that develop a focus, controlling idea, and logical development of the argument.</td>
<td>● Reflect on the decisions you have made that develop a focus, controlling idea, and logical development of the argument.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Revise by studying and creating concise stories that serve as evidence and make clear points to support the claim.</td>
<td>● Trace the diction to identify methods of appeal, and trace diction to reduce and control emotional appeal and develop logical appeal and tone.</td>
<td>● Trace the diction to identify methods of appeal, and trace diction to reduce and control emotional appeal and develop logical appeal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Edit words, sentences, and punctuation.</td>
<td>● Edit words, sentences, and punctuation.</td>
<td>● Edit on the word, sentence and punctuation level, identifying and correcting common errors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Develop sentence variety to engage a reader.</td>
<td>● Develop sentence variety to engage a reader.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Writers Workshop Unit of Study
7th Grade – Writing the Argument
Abstract

Unit Description (overview):
Students identify a range of local problems that they believe are solvable. They practice defining these problems and analyzing their effects in order to develop workable solutions. Once they identify a local problem for which they would like to propose a solution, students conduct research from multiple sources to gain a deeper understanding of their chosen problem and how it can be solved. As they draft their proposal essay, students will seek the best structure for this piece and focus on using appropriate tone and diction for their target audience. Students’ proposals will address the feasibility and credibility of the solution.

To assist with the specificity of lessons, teachers may want to narrow the topic field from which students choose. This can help focus the research lessons and sources students choose from.

- Example #1/Neighborhood Focus – Have students brainstorm issues they experience in their neighborhoods. Issues might include: graffiti, not enough green space for playing, speeding cars in residential areas, safety.
- Example #2/ School Focus – Have your students brainstorm problems they experience at school. These might include bullying, dislike of the cafeteria options, not enough recess, a lack of resources for particular classes, etc. To narrow further, you might have them focus on buildings and grounds, daily schedule, or student-to-student interaction etc.

Interdisciplinary Options
- Collaborate with science to work on proposals for environmental problems like climate change, oil spills, disaster response, and lake-related issues.
- Collaborate with social studies to work on policy proposals—proposed changes to current laws that have resulted in problems either locally or statewide.

Terms

Argument
- In life- conflicts engaged in using language.
- In writing - opinions that can be backed up with evidence.

Problem- any question or matter involving doubt, uncertainty, or difficulty; a question proposed for solution or discussion.
- Problem Statement – a clear and concise statement of a problem that defines the causes and effects.

Proposal- an argument that presents a solution for how to solve an existing problem. The audience for a proposal is the person or people who have the power to carry out the solution or change the law.

Evidence- details, facts, and reasons that support a debatable claim.
- Anecdotal Evidence- evidence based on personal observation and experience, often in the form of a brief story. Can come from the writer, friends, family, and acquaintances.
- Factual Evidence- data, confirmed facts, and research performed by experts. Found by the writer performing research.

Cause – the situation or event that generates a problem.

Effect - the difficulties or outcomes that result from the problem.

Feasible- able to be done or put into effect; possible.

- Feasible Solution
  - Practical- actually solves the problem, the time and effort is worthwhile given the nature of the problem.
  - Affordable- not too expensive and the money exists to pay for the solution.
• Preferable- better than other potential solutions.

Annotate- to make notes on a text that summarize its meaning and extend its ideas; annotation also includes posing questions from the reader to the writer.

Reverse Outline – an outline of the structure of an existing text that notes the focus or key claim of each paragraph and each paragraph’s purpose in the essay.

Viable- practical, feasible, usable, adaptable; able to live and grow.

Viable Writing Topic- one that the writer:
• can make an argument for
• has enough to say to engage the reader
• thinks the reader will care about
• can find enough evidence to support a claim regarding
• knows will fulfill the expectations of the rubric

Proposal Essay Topic Viability
1.) the problem is clearly defined and there is evidence of it
2.) the proposal has the potential to help the community
3.) potential solutions to the problem exist

Idea Generation (brainstorming) – a first stage process where the writer produces a list of ideas, topics, or arguments without crossing any possibilities off the list. The goal is to create a “storm” of creative energy to open up thinking about the writing task and access ideas the writer might not have realized she had. For resources on brainstorming techniques visit. http://www.unc.edu/depts/wcweb/handouts/brainstorming.html

Relevant (in reference to research sources) – appropriate, significant, and important to the matter at hand.

Credible Source (in reference to research sources) – a reliable and accurate text created by experts in the field.

Process
Writing a proposal essay to define a problem and its effects (cause and effect), then suggest a detailed solution, arguing for the feasibility of this solution.

By generating: a solution for a school or neighborhood problem.

By reading: model proposal essays, as well as articles, video, and websites about the selected problem and potential solution(s).

By drafting: body paragraphs that define the problem, its effects, a proposed solution and explaining why this solution will be effective.

By researching: multimedia sources to find evidence that supports the effects of the problem and the feasibility of the proposed solution.

By revising and editing: for clear statement of the problem and its effects, detailed solution, thorough explanation of how the solution will resolve the problem, effective use of evidence supporting the effects of the problem and feasibility of the solution, and proper spelling and syntax.
## Standards

**Common Core Standards: Argument Writing:** The following standards apply to reading and writing in narrative template tasks. Refer to the 6-12 standards for grade-appropriate specifics that fit each task and module being developed. The standards numbers and general content remain the same across all grades, but details vary.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>CCR Anchor Standards for Reading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RI.7.1</td>
<td>Cite several pieces of textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI.7.2</td>
<td>Determine two or more central ideas in a text and analyze their development over the course of the text; provide an objective summary of the text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI.7.4</td>
<td>Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text, including figurative, connotative, and technical meanings; analyze the impact of a specific word choice on meaning and tone.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI.7.5</td>
<td>Analyze the structure an author uses to organize a text, including how the major sections contribute to the whole and to the development of the ideas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI.7.8</td>
<td>Trace and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is sound and the evidence is relevant and sufficient to support the claims.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI.7.10</td>
<td>By the end of the year, read and comprehend literary nonfiction in the grades 6–8 text complexity band proficiently, with scaffolding as needed at the high end of the range.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>CCR Anchor Standards for Writing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W.7.1</td>
<td>Write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.7.4</td>
<td>Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (Grade-specific expectations for writing types are defined in standards 1–3 above.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.7.5</td>
<td>With some guidance and support from peers and adults, develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach, focusing on how well purpose and audience have been addressed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.7.6</td>
<td>Use technology, including the Internet, to produce and publish writing and link to and cite sources as well as to interact and collaborate with others, including linking to and citing sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.7.7</td>
<td>Conduct short research projects to answer a question, drawing on several sources and generating additional related, focused questions for further research and investigation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.7.8</td>
<td>Gather relevant information from multiple print and digital sources, using search terms effectively; assess the credibility and accuracy of each source; and quote or paraphrase the data and conclusions of others while avoiding plagiarism and following a standard format for citation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.7.9</td>
<td>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.7.10</td>
<td>Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of discipline-specific tasks, purposes, and audiences.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>CCR Anchor Standards for Speaking and Listening</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SL.7.1</td>
<td>Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grade 7 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL.7.2</td>
<td>Analyze the main ideas and supporting details presented in diverse media and formats (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) and explain how the ideas clarify a topic, text, or issue under study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL.7.3</td>
<td>Delineate a speaker’s argument and specific claims, evaluating the soundness of the reasoning and the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SL.7.6</td>
<td>Adapt speech to a variety of contexts and tasks, demonstrating command of formal English when...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCR Anchor Standards for Language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.7.1.</td>
<td>Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.7.2.</td>
<td>Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.7.3</td>
<td>Use knowledge of language and its conventions when writing, speaking, reading, or listening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.7.4</td>
<td>Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words or phrases based on grade 7 reading and content, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.7.6.</td>
<td>Acquire and use accurately grade-appropriate general academic and domain-specific words and phrases; gather vocabulary knowledge when considering a word or phrase important to comprehension or expression.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overview of Sessions: Teaching Points and Unit Assessments

Pre-Unit Assessment Task

TEACHING POINTS

Generating Ideas for Argument Writing

1. When people identify problems in their neighborhoods, cities, states, nation and even the world that they can’t solve by themselves, they write proposals that present solutions. These solutions can be enacted by citizen groups, lawmakers, officials, and government employees. Proposals can also suggest a change in an existing rule or law that is ineffective. Writing a proposal to solve a problem involves defining the problem, including its causes and effects, as well as explaining the potential solution and why this solution is feasible. But before you can write a proposal, you have to prove there is truly a problem by gathering evidence of it.

2. Writing a proposal to solve a problem involves defining the problem, including its causes and effects, as well as explaining the potential solution and why this solution is best. But before you can write a proposal, you have to prove there is truly a problem by gathering evidence of it. Developing a feasible solution to an identified problem means coming up with a plan that will appeal to those who will implement it by being practical, affordable and preferable.

3. Writing a proposal to solve a problem involves defining the problem, including its causes and effects, as well as explaining the potential solution and why this solution is best. But before you can write a proposal, you have to prove there is truly a problem by gathering evidence of it. Developing a feasible solution to an identified problem means coming up with a plan that will appeal to those who will implement it by being practical, affordable and preferable.

4. Before writing a proposal, or any kind of text, it is helpful to examine how other writers have done the same job you are about to do. Studying mentor texts (models) helps a writer determine what will strengthen their argument and what mistakes to avoid. Annotating—or marking up—a text, will provide you a map of the important ideas in the piece. And creating a reverse outline will help you understand how a writer has organized their argument. When writers outline, they determine the order of the points of their argument. So when we create a reverse outline, we note the order of topics in a text that already exists. The purpose of a reverse outline is to consider possible structures for your own work. Rubrics provide student writers with a clear understanding of how they can meet the expectations of a particular mode and assignment.

5. Before writing a proposal, or any kind of text, it is helpful to examine how other writers have done the same job you are about to do. Studying mentor texts (models) helps a writer determine what will strengthen their argument and what mistakes to avoid. Annotating—or marking up—a text, will provide you a map of the important ideas in the piece. And creating a reverse outline will help you understand how a writer has organized their argument. When writers outline, they determine the order of the points of their argument. So when we create a reverse outline, we note the order of topics in a text that already exists. The purpose of a reverse outline is to consider possible structures for your own work. Rubrics provide student writers with a clear understanding of how they can meet the expectations of a particular mode and assignment.

6. To write a proposal, you must first determine what problem you will propose to solve. Brainstorming to generate topic ideas is an important step in the writing process. Next, writers must select a topic from their brainstormed list that is viable for the writing situation. A proposal is viable when 1.) the problem is clearly defined and there is evidence of it, 2.) the proposal has the potential to help the community, and 3.) potential solutions to the problem exist.

7. To write a proposal, you must first determine what problem you will propose to solve. Brainstorming to generate topic ideas is an important step in the writing process. Next, writers must select a topic from their brainstormed list that is viable for the writing situation. A proposal is viable when 1.) the problem is clearly defined and there is evidence of it, 2.) the proposal has the potential to help the community, and 3.) potential solutions to the problem exist.

Creating/Planning

8. Proposal writing requires thorough research to define evidence of the problem, the problem’s causes and effects, as well as its solutions. To perform research efficiently and accurately, writers must know how to ask good questions and identify key search terms.
9. Writers must take a trial and error approach with research as they find sources, determine their credibility, gain new knowledge about their topic, and further define the information and evidence they must gather. The credibility of sources can be determined by type of source, author, sponsoring institution, and cross-referencing facts.

**Drafting**

10. Once a writer has collected multiple credible sources, s/he must decide what information from each source is relevant and how it will be used in the proposal. This requires the writer to categorize source information based on the parts of a proposal and how the information will act as evidence for a particular component of the piece. Paraphrasing is one way to present key information from a credible source.

11. Proposals must have clear statements of the problem that outline the cause(s) and effect(s). The language a writer uses will vary depending on who his/her audience is.

12. The first half of a proposal must define the problem and explore cause and effect to provide evidence of the problem. This persuades the audience of the seriousness and implications of the problem. Incorporating research into a proposal involves paraphrasing and/or quoting sources. This evidence from outside sources strengthens the argument of the proposal.

13. The solution portion of a proposal essay can be multi-part or offer multiple solutions to address all the effects of the problem. Giving evidence of how other people/communities have employed similar solutions gives a writer’s argument more credibility.

**Revising and Editing**

14. After writers complete a draft, they revisit what they have written to see if it makes sense, needs to be re-organized and addresses the target audience. Revision is essential to good writing.

15. Writers ask for constructive criticism from other writers in order to determine how to best revise their pieces. This feedback can come from peers who carefully and respectfully critique another student’s writing. This feedback is then used to revise the piece to improve on content, organization, and argumentation.

16. After writers complete a draft, they revisit what they have written to see if it makes sense, needs to be re-organized and addresses the target audience. Revision is essential to good writing. Conferencing with another writer or the teacher can be helpful in devising and carrying out a revision plan.

17. After writers complete a draft, they revisit what they have written to see if it makes sense, needs to be re-organized and addresses the target audience. Revision is essential to good writing. Conferencing with another writer or the teacher can be helpful in devising and carrying out a revision plan.

18. The last step that writers take before sending off a piece of writing is to edit it to catch all the small grammatical errors. Small grammatical and punctuation errors can trip a reader up, making your argument less clear. Reflecting on the writing process helps writers refine their process for future writing projects.

---

**Mid-Unit Assessment Task**

**Post-Unit Summative Assessment Task**

Consider a school or neighborhood problem that you have a solution for. For this proposal essay, summarize the problem by defining it, explaining whom it affects, and describing possible long-term outcomes it could have. Then lay out a detailed proposal for a solution. Explain what it would take to implement your solution and why it’s feasible. Briefly discuss why your solution is better than alternate solutions.

---

Copyright © 2010-2014 by the Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators and Oakland Schools
# Proposal Essay Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>On-Target</th>
<th>Novice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Content</strong></td>
<td>The writer:</td>
<td>The writer:</td>
<td>The writer:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provides a compelling introduction that introduces the problem and makes a claim about how to solve it.</td>
<td>• Introduces the problem and makes a claim about how to solve it.</td>
<td>• Introduces the problem and makes a claim about how to solve it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Presents the cause(s) and effect(s) of the problem, explaining the interrelations of multiple causes and effects.</td>
<td>• Presents the cause(s) and effect(s) of the problem.</td>
<td>• Presents the problem and either its causes or effects but not both; or presents both cause and effect but does not make clear the link between them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Outlines a feasible solution and explains why this solution is better than other options.</td>
<td>• Outlines a feasible solution.</td>
<td>• Outlines a solution without clearly illustrating its feasibility; or does not outline a complete solution; or solution doesn’t address all aspects of the problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Uses credible evidence to o Show the existence of the problem. o Support the feasibility of the solution.</td>
<td>• Uses credible evidence to o Show the existence of the problem. o Support the feasibility of the solution.</td>
<td>• Evidence of the problem is either insufficient or not from credible sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Employs a variety of evidence types: factual, anecdotal, statistical, authorities in the field.</td>
<td>• Employs a variety of evidence types: factual, anecdotal, statistical, authorities in the field.</td>
<td>• Does not consistently or accurately cite sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Cites sources correctly and accurately.</td>
<td>• Cites sources correctly and accurately.</td>
<td>• Readers are not provided with suggestions for how to act on the proposed solution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provides readers with suggestions for how to act on the proposed solution and explains what will happen if the problem is not solved.</td>
<td>• Provides readers with suggestions for how to act on the proposed solution.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td>• The chosen structure consistently reveals the writer’s line of reasoning both in the presentation of the problem and its solution.</td>
<td>• The chosen structure usually reveals the line of reasoning to illustrate o the cause and effect of the problem o how the proposed solution will solve the problem, with only occasionally misplaced paragraphs or sentences.</td>
<td>• The chosen structure does not make clear the line of reasoning to illustrate o the cause and effect of the problem o how the proposed solution will solve the problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Transitions also make clear the line of reasoning and create a logical flow between sentences and paragraphs.</td>
<td></td>
<td>• The arrangement of paragraphs and sentences lacks logic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Style &amp; Mechanics</strong></td>
<td>• Voice is persuasive, authoritative and consistently appropriate for the intended audience.</td>
<td>• Voice is appropriately persuasive and formal for the intended audience.</td>
<td>• Voice is not appropriate for the intended audience; or shifts from informal to formal throughout the essay.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The word choice is interesting, reflects the intended audience, and is specific to the chosen topic.</td>
<td>• The word choice usually reflects the intended audience and is specific to the chosen topic.</td>
<td>• The word choice is simplistic and/or general and is not specific to the topic or intended audience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Sentence structures are varied and complex.</td>
<td>• Sentence structure is varied.</td>
<td>• Essay employs subject/verb sentence structure with little variety.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The essay contains no errors in punctuation.</td>
<td>• Sentences are properly punctuated in most cases.</td>
<td>• Contains numerous punctuation errors that affect meaning and fluidity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Process Checklist</strong></td>
<td>The writer:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Brainstormed to discover multiple topics and selected the most viable.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Drafted to explore and revise his/her topic choice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Revised his/her research questions to find effective evidence.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Evaluated the credibility of his/her sources.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Revised his/her draft to achieve greater coherency and clarity.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Edited for clarity and an error-free essay.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copyright © 2010-2014 by the Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators and Oakland Schools
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Essential Questions</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| - What is a proposal?  
- What is a problem?  
- How do you know something is a problem?  
- What is evidence?  
- What is cause and effect?  
- What is a good solution? |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preparation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| For section #1 of the session, review the Proposal Essay Anchor Chart in conjunction with the Teaching Points.  
Consider generating alternate examples of proposals that will appeal to your particular population of students.  
Review and make copies of the What’s Your Problem handout. This process will help you anticipate students’ difficulties with this handout as you think about evidence of a particular problem, its cause and effects, as well as how you landed on your particular solution. This initial thinking about how we identify and solve problems is foundational to students’ later work in this unit when they will identify problems and propose feasible solutions. Review the Do We Have a Problem Here? handout that can act as a model for your students during this thinking/writing activity. Both handouts are included after the session. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Point</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| When people identify problems in their neighborhoods, cities, states, nation and even the world that they can’t solve by themselves, they write proposals that present solutions. These solutions can be enacted by citizen groups, lawmakers, officials, and government employees. Proposals can also suggest a change in an existing rule or law that is ineffective. Writing a proposal to solve a problem involves defining the problem, including its causes and effects, as well as explaining the potential solution and why this solution is feasible. But before you can write a proposal, you have to prove there is truly a problem by gathering evidence of it.  
Skills:  
- Define a problem by gathering evidence.  
- Define a problem by articulating the cause and effect relationship evident in the scenario.  
- Articulate why a particular solution was chosen.  
Strategies:  
- Introduce students to key terms and concepts in a mini-lecture.  
- Have students explore concepts and terms by identifying problems they have recently solved.  
Introduce the Teaching Point using the Proposal Essay Anchor Chart: When people identify problems in their neighborhoods, cities, states, nation and even the world that they can’t solve by themselves, they write proposals that present solutions. These solutions can be enacted by citizen groups, lawmakers, officials, and government officials. Proposals can also suggest a change in an existing rule or law that is ineffective. Writing a proposal to solve a problem involves defining the problem, including its causes and effects, as well as explaining the potential solution and why this solution is feasible. But before you can write a proposal, you have to prove there is truly a problem by gathering evidence of it.  
Put key terms on the board: problem, cause, effect, evidence, solution. Let the students know that they will be defining these words by the end of the class period.  
Examples of Proposals:  
- Persuade the principal to change a school rule.  
- Convince your parents to buy you a new cell phone.  
- Proposing that your city build a skate park for teens.  
- Proposing a plan to the State Board of Education to decrease the high school dropout rate statewide. |
What’s Your Problem?: Students as Solution Seekers

- To help them define the key terms and before tackling local problems, students should practice identifying problems and solutions in their own lives.
- Use the What’s Your Problem: Students as Solution Seekers handout to walk your students through the following thinking and writing exercise.
- To model possible responses to each section, project/share the Do We Have a Problem Here? handout.

Have students generate a list of problems that they have recently solved. If students struggle to come up with problems solved, have them also include problems in their daily life that they wish to solve. After a few minutes, have students share their lists and record them on the board. The list might look something like this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Friends fighting over which movie to see</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dealing with forgotten homework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>no milk for cereal at breakfast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>little sister coming in room all the time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dog barking during dinner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiting for the bus in the cold</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At this point, define the term evidence with the class: facts, details, and reasons that prove a situation or event is a problem.

Have students select one of their solved problems and note, list, or explain how they knew it was a problem. What made them feel this was a problem? What evidence can they give of this problem? Share the example from Do We Have a Problem Here?

**Why My Little Sister Coming Into My Room is a Problem**

- She comes into my room every night and won’t leave.
- I feel annoyed when she’s in my room.
- She takes my stuff and doesn’t give it back—usually my favorite clothes which I then can’t find when I want to wear them.
- She distracts me from doing my homework and talking on the phone.
- She listens in on my conversations and tells my mom things she shouldn’t.

Have a few students share their problem and evidence.

Point out that these are examples of evidence that the problem exists. In fact, this evidence actually points to the effects of the problem. Lasting effects given the evidence above would be:

- Missing clothes
- Poor homework completion
- Getting in trouble with mom

Ask students to explain the reason WHY their problem occurs in the first place. What is the cause of the problem? Using the example above, the answer to the question might be:

- My little sister looks up to me.
- She wants to be around me all the time.
- She gets bored when she’s alone.

Identify this reason or reasons as the cause of the problem.

Before completing this section, students need to define what a good solution looks like. Solicit their input. Ideas might include:

- The time, money, and/or effort are worthwhile given the nature of the problem.
- Will actually fix the problem.
- Better than other solutions.

Have students brainstorm a solution to the sister in the room problem. Next, have them generate a solution for their own problem and analyze if it will address most or all of the effects of a problem. They will need to revisit the evidence list for the problem to determine this.
| **Review** | To reinforce the content of the lesson and determine how much students have retained, ask them to define the terms:  
|  | o Problem  
|  | o Cause and effect  
|  | o Evidence  
|  | o Good Solution |

| **Assessment** | Collect students’ *What’s Your Problem* handouts. Assess how well they identified problems, broke down the evidence, causes, long term effects and solutions and showed a clear understanding of each concept. |
Proposals try to persuade the audience to make a change to or take action on practices, behaviors, laws, rules, funding, habits, policies, etc.
What’s Your Problem?
Students as Solution Seekers

A. DAILY PROBLEMS
Make a list of all the problems in your daily life you have recently solved. These should concern you, your friends, and your family. (Can’t think of anything? Also list problems you would like to solve.)

1. 

2. 

3. 

4. 

B. EVIDENCE of the PROBLEM
Select one problem from the list above and give evidence (facts, details, reasons) for why it was clearly a problem.

The Problem: 

Evidence:
1. 

2. 

3. 

4. 
## C. LONG-TERM EFFECTS

If this problem was not/is not solved, what are the lasting effects it could have?

1. 
2. 
3. 
4. 

## D. CAUSES of the PROBLEM

Why did this problem exist in the first place? How/why did it come about?

1. 
2. 
3. 
4.
E. GOOD SOLUTION

Explain how you solved or could solve this problem.

Is this a long-term solution? To answer this question, examine which effects of the problem this solution addresses. (Look at your evidence list.) Are all of them taken care of by the solution?
Do We Have a Problem Here?

A. Problem: any question or matter involving doubt, uncertainty, or difficulty; a question proposed for solution or discussion.
   - Friends fighting over which movie to see
   - Dealing with forgotten homework
   - No milk for cereal at breakfast
   - Little sister coming in room all the time
   - Dog barking during dinner
   - Waiting for the bus in the cold

B. Evidence: facts, details, and reasons that prove a situation is a problem.

Why My Little Sister Coming Into My Room Is a Problem
   - She comes into my room every night and won’t leave.
   - I feel annoyed when she’s in my room.
   - She takes my stuff and doesn’t give it back—usually my favorite clothes which I then can’t find when I want to wear them.
   - She distracts me from doing my homework and talking on the phone.
   - She listens in on my conversations and tells my mom things she shouldn’t.

C. Evidence points to the effects of the problem. Lasting effects given the evidence would be:
   - Missing clothes
   - Poor homework completion
   - Getting in trouble with Mom

D. Cause: the reason why the problem occurs in the first place.
   - My little sister looks up to me
   - She wants to be around me all the time
   - She’s bored when she’s alone

E. Good Solution:
   - Will actually fix the problem.
   - The time, money, and/or effort is worthwhile given the nature of the problem.
   - Better than other solutions.
## Sessions 2 and 3

### Essential Questions
- How do you know something is a problem?
- What is evidence?
- What is cause and effect?
- How do you show a solution is feasible?

### Preparation

**Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem**

Make copies of the **Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem** handout. Your students will be working on this thinking exercise during the session. Decide which problem and associated videos you want them to watch. There are suggested videos about environmental problems and their solutions below. You can also find a video about a problem salient to your student population/community and curriculum using or YouTube. For this lesson, it’s most useful to select one issue to focus on.

Use the **Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem** handout to take notes about the nature of the problem, evidence, causes and solutions and to determine when you might want to pause the video to have students record their observations and pair/share.

**Suggested Videos:**
- Global Water Shortage by BBC America: [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Gg-ac0EaYDQ&feature=related](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Gg-ac0EaYDQ&feature=related)
- BP Oil Spill Effects on Wildlife by Skywatch Media: [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GARHmc7WRqs](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GARHmc7WRqs)
- Global Warming 101 by National Geographic: [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oJAbATJCugs](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oJAbATJCugs)

### Determining the Feasibility of a Solution

**Feasible Solution Anchor Chart**. Watch a corresponding solution video for the problem you have decided to focus on (or find one of your own). Use the **Is the Solution Feasible** handout to record your ideas and to determine when you might want to pause the video to have students record their observations and pair/share.

**Suggested Videos:**
- Water Crisis - a Solution: [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B7jCGk6jvME](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=B7jCGk6jvME)
- Kevin Costner’s Solution for the BP Oil Spill: [http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=u4eSqSu2hWk](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=u4eSqSu2hWk)


### Teaching Point

Writing a proposal to solve a problem involves defining the **problem**, including its **causes and effects**, as well as explaining the potential **solution** and why this solution is best. But before you can write a proposal, you have to prove there is truly a problem by gathering **evidence** of it. Developing a feasible solution to an identified problem means coming up with a plan that will appeal to those who will implement it by being **practical, affordable and preferable**.

**Skills:**
- Define a problem by gathering evidence.
- Define a problem by articulating the cause and effect relationship evident in the scenario.
- Examine the feasibility of a solution.
| Strategies: | Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem  
| --- | ---  
| - Watch news pieces that illustrate a problem by providing evidence and showing causes and effects.  
| - Watch a solution proposal video that points to feasibility.  
| Active Engagement | a.) Reintroduce the teaching points: Writing a proposal to solve a problem involves defining the problem, including its causes and effects, as well as explaining the potential solution and why this solution is best. But before you can write a proposal, you have to prove there is truly a problem by gathering evidence of it.  
b.) Students will undertake a thinking process similar to the one from yesterday, but this time they will analyze a global problem.  
| - While watching the selected video on the problem, have students work on the Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem handout.  
| - Pause the video at key points and have students pair and share.  
c.) Review the responses to the handout as a class. Ask students:  
| - What evidence from the segment proved this is a problem?  
| - What else would you like to know about this problem from an evidence standpoint? (This extension question will get students thinking about the evidence needed to convince an audience that a problem is, in fact, a serious problem.)  
| What Does “Feasible” Mean?  
a.) Introduce the teaching point: Developing a feasible solution to an identified problem means coming up with a plan that will appeal to those who will implement it by being practical, affordable and preferable.  
b.) Ask the students: Given the teaching point, what do you think the definition of the word “feasible” is? Help them develop a definition that looks something like: able to be done or put into effect; possible.  
c.) Show the Feasible Solution Anchor Chart.  
d.) Return to one or two of the problem/solution scenarios you discussed yesterday as a class. Discuss their feasibility.  
| Determining if a Solution is Feasible  
a.) Explain to students that at least half of their proposal will be an explanation of their solution and evidence that proves its feasibility. So how do you determine if a solution is feasible? Have students watch a video on a solution to the corresponding problem you just discussed, pausing the video as needed so students can digest and record what they are watching on the Is the Solution Feasible handout, as well as pair and share.  
b.) As a class, discuss the feasibility of the proposed solution. Ask students:  
| - What seems good about this proposal?  
| - Does it address all the effects of the problem?  
| - What about it would be hard to carry out?  
| - Who might be difficult to convince about the effectiveness of this solution?  
| - Take a final vote about whether it’s feasible or not.  
| Assessment | Collect students’ Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem and Is the Solution Feasible handouts. Assess the quality of evidence, paraphrasing, identification of the problem’s causes, and discussion of the solution’s feasibility.  

Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem

**Problem**- any question or matter involving doubt, uncertainty, or difficulty; a question proposed for solution or discussion.

**Evidence**- reasons, facts, details that support a debatable claim

Often evidence of a problem = the effects of a problem because the clear effects of a problem prove that it exists.

**Cause** – the situation or event that generates a problem.

**Effect** - the difficulties or outcomes that result from the problem.

*****

**Video Title:**

**Name of Problem**

List the facts (evidence) the video gives to illustrate the problem.

1. 
2. 
3. 
4. 

Where is the problem the worst? Give evidence that supports this.

Define the problem in your own words:
What are some of the causes of this problem?

1. 

2. 

3. 

4. 

5. 

What are solutions proposed to solve the problem?
Gathering Evidence to Define a Problem
(Teacher copy--Global Water Shortage Video by the BBC)

**Problem**- any question or matter involving doubt, uncertainty, or difficulty; a question proposed for solution or discussion.

**Evidence**- reasons, facts, details that support a debatable claim

*Often evidence of a problem = the effects of a problem because the clear effects of a problem prove that it exists.*

**Cause** – the situation or event that generates a problem.

**Effect** - the difficulties or outcomes that result from the problem.

****

**Video Title:** Global Water Shortage, part 1, BBC America

**Name of Problem:** water shortage

**List the facts (evidence) the video gives to illustrate the problem.**

1. 1.1 billion people don’t have access to sufficient drinking water.

2. Water use is growing at twice the rate of the population.

3. In 25 years, half of the continent of Africa will be living under water stress.

4. Violence (wars) is erupting over drinking water, which is in short supply.

**Where is the problem the worst? Give evidence that supports this.**

Africa – violence erupts over water shortages.

Mexico City- the city has sunk by 9m and 40% of the water supply is lost due to leaky pipes.

Sydney- lower lakes face an ecological disaster due to lack of rain.

West Bank- Palestinians have little access to drinkable water because it is controlled by Israelis.

**Define the problem in your own words:**

There is less drinking water available on the planet than what is needed.

**What are some of the causes of this problem?**

6. Fast growing global population.
7. Climate change leading to decline of rainfall.
8. Ground water depletion.
9. Greater demand for water.
10. No alternative for water.

**What solutions are proposed to solve the problem?**

a. Desalination
b. Rain water harvesting
c. Better management of the landscapes
Feasible Solution Anchor Chart

Practical - actually solves the problem; the time and effort is worthwhile given the nature of the problem

Affordable - not too expensive and the money exists to pay for the solution

Preferable - better than other potential solutions
Is the Solution Feasible?

**Feasible:** able to be done or put into effect; possible.

**Practical - Affordable - Preferable**

**What** problem does the solution address? (Summarize in your own words.)

**What** is the plan? What steps must be taken for the solution to be carried out?

1.
2.
3.
4.
5.
6.

**PRACTICAL**

1. **How** does the solution address the problem? Which effects of the problem does the solution address?

2. Do you think this solution is effective enough? What parts of the problem are **not** addressed by it?
AFFORDABLE

1. **Who** will have to be convinced about the effectiveness/affordability of the solution?

2. Does the **money exist** to pay for this solution? How will the solution be funded?

PREFERABLE

1. What are other solutions to the problem?

2. Why is this one the best?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential Questions</th>
<th>Sessions 4 and 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What are the parts of a proposal?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How do you organize a proposal?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What does a strong proposal look like?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How do writers use rubrics?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preparation</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Review the Proposal Essay Rubric. Mark any</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>terms you might need to review with students.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This includes writing terminology (e.g.,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>evidence, conclusion) and high-frequency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>words (verbs that direct students in their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thinking and writing (e.g., analyze,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>convince, persuade, compare).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read &quot;Water Waste at the University of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan&quot; by Elyssa Weigand (attached after</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>this session) or select another sample</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>proposal essay to share with students. Use</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Understanding the Proposal handout</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(attached after this session) to mark key</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>components of the mentor text and make</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>margin notes, as well as a reverse outline.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reverse Outline – an outline of the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>structure of an existing text that notes the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>focus or key claim of each paragraph and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>each paragraph’s purpose in the essay.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review the Rubric Study handout (attached</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>after this session). Use the Proposal Essay</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubric to grade the mentor text students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>will evaluate.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Point</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before writing a proposal, or any kind of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>text, it is helpful to examine how other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>writers have done the same job you are about</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to do. Studying mentor texts (models) helps</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a writer determine what will strengthen their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>argument and what mistakes to avoid.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annotating—or marking up—a text, will</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provide you a map of the important ideas in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the piece. And creating a reverse outline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>will help you understand how a writer has</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organized their argument. When writers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>outline, they determine the order of the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>points of their argument. So when we create</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a reverse outline, we note the order of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>topics in a text that already exists. The</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>purpose of a reverse outline is to consider</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>possible structures for your own work. Rubrics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provide student writers with a clear</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>understanding of how they can meet the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expectations of a particular mode and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assignment.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skills:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Identify “problem” and “solution” in mentor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>texts.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Identify “cause and effect” in models.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Identify evidence in a mentor text.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Analyze the organization of a text.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Understand the expectations set forth in a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rubric.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategies:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Annotate mentor texts.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Create a reverse outline of the mentor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>texts to determine possible structures for a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>proposal.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Examine and paraphrase rubric elements.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Evaluate a proposal essay mentor text using</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the rubric.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Active Engagement                           |                  |
| Mentor Text Reading and Annotating          |                  |
| • Introduce the teaching point: Before      |                  |
| writing a proposal, or any kind of text,    |                  |
| it is helpful to examine how other writers   |                  |
| have done the same job you are about to do. |                  |
| Studying mentor texts (models) helps a      |                  |
| writer determine what will strengthen their |                  |
| argument and what mistakes to avoid.        |                  |
| Annotating—or marking up—a text, will      |                  |
| provide you a map of the important ideas in |                  |
| the piece.                                 |                  |
| • We mark up a text to help us better       |                  |
| understand it, making a map of our reading, |                  |
| and so it’s easy to find particular points  |                  |
| when we return to the text as we discuss it.|                  |
| • Stress to your students that annotation   |                  |
| includes not just marking up a text with    |                  |
| underlining, stars and highlights, but also |                  |
| making margin notes. Share this definition: |                  |
| Annotate- to make notes on a text that      |                  |
| summarize its meaning and extend its ideas; |                  |
| annotation also includes posing questions   |                  |
| from the reader to the writer.             |                  |
| • Have students read and annotate the       |                  |
| chosen mentor text using the Understanding  |                  |
| the |
Proposal handout.
- Prior to doing so discuss what a margin is.
- Review the handout directions for the first and second reading.
Consider showing the students a model paragraph you have marked up so they know what you expect.

Consider reading and annotating the first few paragraphs together as a class using a projector/overhead, then sending the students off in pairs or trios to finish their annotations. Alternately, after the full class annotation, consider making certain pairs/groups responsible for particular paragraphs.

Bring the class back together to report back on annotations and margin notes made that you mark on the projected version of the text. If pairs/groups have been assigned particular paragraphs, they can report/show/model their annotations to the group.

Mentor Text Reverse Outline
- Introduce the teaching point: Creating a reverse outline will help you understand how a writer has organized their argument. When writers outline, they determine the order of the points of their argument. So when we create a reverse outline, we note the order of topics in a text that already exists. The purpose of a reverse outline is to consider possible structures for your own work.
- On chart paper, have students create a reverse outline of the mentor text using the Understanding a Proposal handout. This activity can be completed in pairs or small groups.
- Check in with each pair/group as they reverse outline to determine if they understand the concept of annotation and that they are marking components correctly.
- Hang the reverse outlines up next to one another in the classroom and compare them. Ask students to observe:
  - What are the similarities and differences between the outlines?
  - Why do you think the writer ordered her argument in this way?
  - Is this order effective? Why or why not?
  - Could particular paragraphs be rearranged?
  - What would the effect of this be?

Rubric Study
- Using the Rubric Study handout, review the meaning of “rubric” and why we use them.
- Have students carefully underline high-frequency words (verbs) they don’t understand and circle writing terminology they are unsure of.
- Discuss all words that need explanation.
- Explain that writers can score differently on each item on the rubric and that teachers look at how a writer scores overall to give a final grade.
  - Big picture = final grade
  - Small picture = each item
  - The big picture is composed of many small pictures.
- Review the directions for assessing the mentor text using the rubric on the Rubric Study handout and divide students into groups to assess the mentor text.
- When students have finished grading, bring the class back together and compare results of the completed rubric. Ask:
  - What was your overall assessment: advanced, on-target, novice
  - How did you score each section?
  - *How come? Provide evidence for the assessment of each section in the rubric. This final step is crucial in helping students bring together and clarify their understanding of proposal essay expectations.

| Independent Practice (Optional) | If you feel your students would benefit from further practice and looking at an additional mentor text, spend an additional session practicing with another proposal model or send the students home with a model and have them annotate for homework. |
| Assessment               | Understanding the Proposal - assess students’ understanding of annotating and reverse outlining, as well as what the components of a proposal essay are based on, given their completed annotations and shared reverse outlines.  
| Rubric Study - assess students’ understanding of the purpose and elements of the rubric based on their use of the rubric to grade the sample proposal essay. |
# Proposal Essay Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>On-Target</th>
<th>Novice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Content</strong></td>
<td>The writer:</td>
<td>The writer:</td>
<td>The writer:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provides a compelling introduction that introduces the problem and makes a claim about how to solve it.</td>
<td>• Introduces the problem and makes a claim about how to solve it.</td>
<td>• Introduces the problem and makes a claim about how to solve it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Presents the cause(s) and effect(s) of the problem, explaining the interrelations of multiple causes and effects.</td>
<td>• Presents the cause(s) and effect(s) of the problem.</td>
<td>• Presents the problem and either its causes or effects but not both; or presents both cause and effect but does not make clear the link between them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Outlines a feasible solution and explains why this solution is better than other options.</td>
<td>• Outlines a feasible solution.</td>
<td>• Outlines a solution without clearly illustrating its feasibility; or does not outline a complete solution; or solution doesn’t address all aspects of the problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Uses credible evidence to</td>
<td>• Uses credible evidence to</td>
<td>• Evidence of the problem is either insufficient or not from credible sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Show the existence of the problem.</td>
<td>• Show the existence of the problem.</td>
<td>• Does not consistently or accurately cite sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Support the feasibility of the solution.</td>
<td>• Support the feasibility of the solution.</td>
<td>• Readers are not provided with suggestions for how to act on the proposed solution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Employs a variety of evidence types: factual, anecdotal, statistical, authorities in the field.</td>
<td>• Cites sources correctly and accurately.</td>
<td>• Cites sources correctly and accurately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provides readers with suggestions for how to act on the proposed solution and explains what will happen if the problem is not solved.</td>
<td>• Provides readers with suggestions for how to act on the proposed solution and explains what will happen if the problem is not solved.</td>
<td>• Provides readers with suggestions for how to act on the proposed solution.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Organization** | The chosen structure consistently reveals the writer’s line of reasoning both in the presentation of the problem and its solution. | The chosen structure usually reveals the line of reasoning to illustrate the cause and effect of the problem or how the proposed solution will solve the problem, with only occasionally misplaced paragraphs or sentences. | The chosen structure does not make clear the line of reasoning to illustrate the cause and effect of the problem or how the proposed solution will solve the problem. |
|                 | • Transitions also make clear the line of reasoning and create a logical flow between sentences and paragraphs. | • The arrangement of paragraphs and sentences lacks logic.              | • The arrangement of paragraphs and sentences lacks logic. |

| **Style & Mechanics** | Voice is persuasive, authoritative and consistently appropriate for the intended audience. | Voice is appropriately persuasive and formal for the intended audience. | Voice is not appropriate for the intended audience; or shifts from informal to formal throughout the essay. |
|                      | • The word choice is interesting, reflects the intended audience, and is specific to the chosen topic. | • The word choice usually reflects the intended audience and is specific to the chosen topic. | • The word choice is simplistic and/or general and is not specific to the topic or intended audience. |
|                      | • Sentence structures are varied and complex. | • Sentence structure is varied. | • Essay employs subject/verb sentence structure with little variety. |
|                      | • The essay contains no errors in punctuation. | • Sentences are properly punctuated in most cases. | • Contains numerous punctuation errors that affect meaning and fluidity. |

| **Process Checklist** | The writer:                                                               |                                                                 |                                                                 |
|                      | o Brainstormed to discover multiple topics and selected the most viable.    |                                                                 |                                                                 |
|                      | o Drafted to explore and revise his/her topic choice.                      |                                                                 |                                                                 |
|                      | o Revised his/her research questions to find effective evidence.           |                                                                 |                                                                 |
|                      | o Evaluated the credibility of his/her sources.                            |                                                                 |                                                                 |
|                      | o Revised his/her draft to achieve greater coherency and clarity.          |                                                                 |                                                                 |
|                      | o Edited for clarity and an error-free essay.                              |                                                                 |                                                                 |
Understanding the Proposal

First Reading: Annotation
During your first reading of the proposal, mark the following items. Use these annotation marks:

- **Underline** the sentences where the problem is first introduced.
- **Put a star next to any effects of the problem. Remember, this is also evidence that the problem exists.**
- **Put brackets around the cause(s) of the problem.**
- **Put a happy face 😊 where the proposed solution begins.**
- **Put a number sign # next to any sentences that explain the feasibility of the solution.**

Second Reading: Margin Notes
During your second reading, make notes about the following questions in the margin:

- **At the top of the first page:** Who do you believe the audience is? Who could actually make this solution happen?
- **In the left-hand margins:** Note any places where you would like more evidence, either of the problem or the feasibility of the solution. What else do you want to know? Write it in the margin.
- **In the right-hand margins:** Pose at least 2 questions to the writer. You might disagree with him/her about a claim, want to know more about a point, or want the writer to consider another point of view.

Third Reading: Reverse Outline
When writers outline, they determine the order of the points of their argument. So when we create a reverse outline, we note the order of topics in a text that already exists. The purpose of this exercise is to consider possible structures for our own work.

- Create a reverse outline of the proposal essay you have just read by listing the following components in the order that they occur.
- You may repeat components.
- Note that some paragraphs may contain more than one of these components.
- Each paragraph of the proposal should have a corresponding item in the reverse outline.

Proposal Components
- **Introduction** – including a statement of the problem.
- **Defining the problem and its stakes** – how serious it is
- **Causes** of the problem
- **Effects** of the problem
- **Solution**
  - What it is
  - How we know it will work
  - What it will cost in money or effort
- **Conclusion** – should indicate what will happen if the problem isn’t solved.
Water Waste at the University of Michigan
By Elyssa Wiegand

Approximately 1,180 students live at Mary Markley Residential Hall at the University of Michigan, so this dorm uses large amounts of resources—especially water. Whether brushing their teeth, taking a shower, or flushing the toilet, all 1,180 students use water at some point during the day. Across the university’s campus, improvements have been made to reduce the use of this resource, including low-flow faucet fixtures and toilet flushers. These implementations, which have been proven to reduce water use by 31%, have been installed in buildings such as Shapiro Library and Dana Science Building. But these additions should also be put into operation in campus dorms, where more water is used daily (Greening of Dana).

High water use is a broad issue that pertains to many commercial and living buildings or complexes. On a college campus though, there is a much higher density of people; therefore, a large amount of water is wasted daily. Water use directly affects all of life on earth, as it is required by all organisms (U.S. Water). Over consumption of water can have detrimental effects on the environment, as water is what makes land habitable for animals. Conserving water is also a simple way to save money, which could, in effect, lower tuition to some extent (Why Conserve?).

Figure 1 shows that only a small portion of water in the world is usable for humans. The Great Lakes contain 21% of the world's freshwater, an amount only surpassed by the polar ice caps (Great Lakes). Living in a state surrounded by much of this usable water makes many individuals take this resource for granted.
Figure 1. Worldwide Water Availability (Source: University of Waikato)

Figure 2 below shows an estimation of the amount of water used in Mary Markley Hall. These numbers can change dramatically, depending on the frequency of any individual's use, but the raw numbers show that a large amount of water can be saved each day—up to 10,000 gallons—without even taking drinking water, shower water, or food production water into account.

**Water use at Mary Markley Hall**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Average time spent</th>
<th>Times/day/individual</th>
<th>Water used per individual</th>
<th>Water used per individual with improved utilities</th>
<th>Water saved per day per individual</th>
<th>Water saved by students at Markley</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brushing Teeth (2 gpm-epa.gov)</td>
<td>1 minute</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4 gallons</td>
<td>1 gallon</td>
<td>3 gallons</td>
<td>3,540 gallons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washing Hands (2 gpm-epa.gov)</td>
<td>30 seconds</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5 gallons</td>
<td>1.25 gallons</td>
<td>3.75 gallons</td>
<td>4,425 gallons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flushing Toilet (1.6 gpf-Sloan Valve)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>6 gallons</td>
<td>2 gallons</td>
<td>Total Water Saved: 10,325 gallons / day</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2. Estimated water use/water saved per day at Mary Markley Hall.
(Theoretical values may go up or down, depending on the individual and faucet/toilet used. Using estimation of 1,180 students.)
The two main engineering utilities that should be installed in Markley Residential Hall are dual-flush toilet valves and faucet aerators. According to Sloan Valve Company, a regular commercial toilet uses about 1.6 gallon per flush (gpf). As you can see in Figure 3, the Sloan Uppercut dual-flush handle can be pushed in two directions for two different purposes--up for liquid waste or down for solid waste. Flushing up will only use 1.1 gpf, while flushing down will still use 1.6 gpf. In addition to this toilet valve, faucet aerators would also reduce the amount of water wasted.

While toilet water is measured in gallons per flush, sink water is measured in gallons per minute. There are many different types of faucet aerators that reduce amount of gallons used per minute. The ones currently built into the faucets on campus reduce gpm by 1.5 (Energy and Water Conservation). Another less frequently seen utility on campus is a sensor faucet. These are currently only being used at buildings such as the Undergraduate Science Building. In addition to saving water, these faucets help stop the spread of germs and infectious diseases. Similarly, low-flow showerheads should also be considered, as much more water is wasted in showers. These low-flow showerheads reduce the gallons used per minute to 2.5 gallons or less.

These simple building solutions are already implemented in campus buildings such as the Dana Science Building, the Chemistry Building, and the Shapiro Undergraduate Library. The bathrooms in these buildings do not see as many people per day as most dorms. Specifically, these bathrooms are not used by 1,180 students multiple times per day, as the bathrooms in Mark Markley Hall are. In addition to using toilets and washing hands, students in dorms also take showers and brush their teeth. So installing faucet aerators and dual-flush toilet valves would significantly reduce water usage, save the university money, and lessen the effect of water waste on the environment.

This issue is especially pressing because when the University of Michigan remodeled Mosher-Jordan Residence Hall, it had a great opportunity to add these new faucets and toilet flush valves. But these cost and environment-saving measures were not taken. Figures 4, 5, and 6 (below) show the faucets and toilet flushes that were installed during the renovation—standard faucets and toilet flushers—which makes it safe to assume that the university will not install faucet aerators and dual-flush toilet valves in future Residence Hall.
renovations. The University of Michigan published an Energy and Water Conservation document that included the projects that would be incorporated in new buildings across campus. The water conservation projects include the following: dual flush water closets, ½ gpm aerators for lavatory faucets, and 2 gpm showerheads (Energy and Water Conservation). Despite these regulations, the aerators were only installed in Mosher-Jordan in bathrooms next to the Hill Dining Center; they are not installed in residential bathrooms, which are much more frequently used.

Figures 4, 5, & 6. Figure 4 shows a regular flowing faucet, which are the faucets implemented in Mosher-Jordan's Residential bathrooms. Figure 5 shows a low-flow faucet, that is also a sensor faucet, which are implemented in the non-residential bathrooms at Mosher-Jordan. Figure 6 shows the standard toilet flush/valve that has been implemented in residential bathrooms. (Source: Elyssa Wiegand)

Not adding these features leaves water conservation up to the individual, and many individuals do not make good and careful choices about water usage. The problem is not always that people don’t care or are irresponsible. Instead, water conservation isn’t necessarily the top issue on the minds of college students. According to freshman Brittany Gordon, who lives in Markley, “If the sink automatically turned itself off, I would not need to leave the faucet on/running. I’m always in a hurry, and focusing on turning the sink on and off when I have to get to class isn’t my priority.” A low-flow faucet that also turns off each time your hands or toothbrush leave it would be ideal in any dorm situation.

Without these water conservation add-ons, water will continue to be used in wasteful, excessive amounts in University of Michigan residence halls. The water is simply being used up, and its continuous flow is not benefiting anyone at any point in the water cycle. The best way to solve the problem of excessive water use at the University of Michigan, without leaving the decision up to individuals, is to integrate new toilet, faucet, and shower fixtures into dormitory bathrooms. These implementations are simple and effective methods of saving water. As they have already been introduced into buildings on campus, they should be installed in the buildings that see more users each day. Introducing such simple utilities is non-invasive to the individuals that have to use them. No one will have to change the way they wash their hands or flush the toilet. No one will have to take the extra time or make a decision to save water. If these simple implementations are not integrated at the University of Michigan, 9,500 students living in 18 dorms across campus will be continue to waste huge amounts of water each day. The University of Michigan should take further steps to protect the environment by installing these water conservation fixtures in all dorms by 2015.
Sources


Rubric Study

Rubric: a guide listing specific criteria for grading or scoring academic papers, projects, or tests

Study: to make a careful examination of

What is a rubric?

As the definition above explains, a rubric is a set of rules that shows how a paper, project or test is scored. These expectations are based on the conventions of the mode you’re writing in. For this assignment, you have to explain the problem and its solution. But if you were creating a website, you might be graded on your use of images and how you organized the pages.

How can a rubric help you?

Before writing an essay or creating a project, it’s important to see the rubric so you can meet the expectations of the person grading it. How can you do a good job if you don’t know what a good job looks like?

Rubric Study

Examine the Proposal Essay Rubric by doing the following things:

- Underline any verbs that you don’t understand.
  - The verbs are usually come right after the bullet and tell you what to do (analyze, include, define, employ)
- Circle any writing terms you’re not sure you understand. (conclusion, style, mechanics etc.)

Using the Rubric - Directions

With your neighbor or a small group of students, grade the sample proposal essay you read yesterday.

1. Review your annotations from yesterday on the sample proposal essay.
2. Discuss each bulleted item on the rubric as a group and come to some agreement about how the writer scored—advanced, on-target, or novice.
3. Highlight the description under each item that applies to the sample proposal (advanced, on-target, novice).
4. When you’ve finished reviewing each item, look at the highlights on your rubric. How did the writer do overall? Is the proposal essay as a whole advanced, on-target or novice?
5. Share your decision with the rest of the class.
### Essential Questions

- How do you generate solution possibilities for a proposal?
- How do you decide if a writing topic is viable?

### Preparation

Gather copies of local newspapers and magazines and make a list of the local problems evident from newspaper headlines. In addition or alternately, you can prepare to use a projector and computer to show students the front pages of local (or national) online publications and newscasts. Some sites to consider include:

- [http://www.freep.com/localnews](http://www.freep.com/localnews)
- [http://spinalcolumnonline.com/](http://spinalcolumnonline.com/)

Make copies of the **What is Viability? Handout** and **Viability Anchor Charts**. Both are included after this session.

### Teaching Point

To write a proposal, you must first determine what problem you will propose to solve. Brainstorming to **generate** topic ideas is an important step in the writing process. Next, writers must **select** a topic from their brainstormed list that is **viable** for the writing situation. A proposal is viable when 1.) the problem is clearly defined and there is evidence of it, 2.) the proposal has the potential to help the community, and 3.) potential solutions to the problem exist.

**Skills:**

- Brainstorming possible topics
- Selecting a viable topic given the writing situation

**Strategies:**

- Brainstorm individually and as a group
- Consult newspaper headlines for community problem ideas
- Define and perform the viability test on an identified problem

### Active Engagement/Writer’s Notebook

**Brainstorming – A Long List of Problems**

a.) **Introduce the teaching point:** To write a proposal, you must first determine what problem you will propose to solve. Brainstorming to **generate** topic ideas is an important step in the writing process.

**Initial problem list:** Have students think about the community problems they witness, experience, or hear about on a daily basis in their neighborhoods and cities. Ask them to record a list of all these problems in their writer’s notebook. They may need some help getting started, so give a few examples:

- Potholes in roads not fixed after the winter is over
- Graffiti on buildings downtown that goes unaddressed
- Pack of stray dogs roaming a particular neighborhood
- Bullying in school

b.) **Master List:** Have students share their list items and create a class master list of problems on the board. Stress that because you’re in the brainstorming phase, you’re not evaluating whether or not these problems are solvable. You’re just generating ideas.

**Newspaper Problems:** This activity can be done as a full class or in small groups. Using the copies/projections of the local newspapers, have students identify additional community problems. Model for the students how to pull community problems from a headline. They may pull community problems directly from headlines or a headline might spark a topic idea based on **inference**. For example,

- The headline “Troy holds off on library closing” points directly to the problem of multiple public libraries being closed in and around Detroit due to a massive decrease in tax revenue.
- Whereas the headline “1 arrested, 1 sought in elderly woman’s attack in Detroit” might prompt students to list neighborhood violence or burglary as a problem they are aware of.

c.) **Revise the Class Master List:** Add the problems generated from the newspaper to the master list.
What is Viability? And Viability Testing

a.) Introduce the teaching point: Writers must select a topic that is viable for the writing situation.
b.) Now that students have all these problems that are potential topics for the proposal essay, what do they do with them? Take them through the What is Viability? handout to answer this question.
c.) You will also use the Viability Anchor Charts during this part of the lesson.

Viability Examples

- After discussing examples, have the students come up with examples of their own to assess their initial understanding of this word.

You Try

- This part of the handout is probably best accomplished in pairs or small groups so students can bounce ideas off each other. Alternately, and as a time saver, you can generate dance themes as a class and identify the most viable ones.

Viability with Writing Topics

- Discuss with your students what their criteria tend to be for selecting writing topics.
- Next, review the Writing Topic Viability Anchor Chart.
- Discuss how the students’ initial answers compare to the anchor chart.
- Review the Proposal Essay Topic Viability Anchor Chart.

Viability Testing

- If you feel your students are grasping the concept of topic viability well, you can have them take the graffiti problem and put it to the test themselves as a class using the 3 criteria rather than reviewing the viability test on the handout.

Let’s Practice

- This activity gives students a preview of the activity to come in which they narrow down topic possibilities.
- Working in pairs and trios will help students talk through the criteria and apply them to each topic.

Revising the Master Problem List

- This is probably a long list to go through together, so consider dividing the students into groups and giving each group a portion of the list to evaluate.
- When the class comes back together, groups can report back on the problems they crossed off the list and explain why. As a class, agree on problems on the master list that are not viable because they don’t meet all the viability criteria.

Independent Practice

Students Perform the Viability Test

- Have students select the two problems that interest them most from the master list.
- Provide students with a notecard where they record their viability test – one proposed problem on each side of the notecard.

Problem Viability Notecard

Problem:

Evidence/effects of problem:

Causes of the problem:

Possible Solution(s)

How will solving this problem help the community?

Assessment

Collect students’ viability test notecards. Assess whether for each problem they have:

- selected a community problem that affects many people
• have clearly stated the problem
• have presented 1-3 pieces of evidence/effects of the problem
• can point to at least one cause of the problem
• the solution is plausible
What is Viability?

**Viable**- practical, feasible, usable, adaptable; able to live and grow.

*Viability* is a noun. The adjective form is **viable**.

Viability (noun): the ability to live and grow
Viable (adj.): practical, usable, adaptable.

What does viability have to do with writing?
Finding a **viable** topic for a writing task is one of the most important steps in the writing process. When you spend plenty of time brainstorming and pre-writing to figure out how well your topic fits the writing task, you’re more likely to produce a successful draft and finished product!

Let’s Look at Viability Examples:

**Hit Songs**- When signing recording artists to a record label, record executives have to decide if a singer’s music is viable in the market. Will teenagers buy the songs on iTunes? Will they watch their videos on Youtube? Songs by Taylor Swift, Justin Bieber, 50 Cent, Beyonce, the Black Eyed Peas, and Katie Perry were labeled as viable hits by record executives. The executives thought the music would be viable (popular, able to live and grow in the music industry) and make a lot of money. And they were right!

**Movie Stars**- When a film company decides to make a blockbuster Hollywood action movie like *Iron Man*, *X-Men*, or *Transformers*, they cast the major roles based on which actors will make the movie a success. Who will draw the most people to buy tickets? Who is the most viable star? They want to hire an action hero actor like Ben Affleck or Angelina Jolie.

**T.V. Show Plots**- Think of your favorite television show. When the television scriptwriters put together an episode of that show, they must come up with an interesting plot that holds your attention. Interesting things have to happen! The writers must create a viable plot that will make the episode a success. If the plot is unrealistic, boring because not enough happens, or uninteresting to the audience, you’ll change the channel. Each plot they write must for **viable** to be turned into an episode that is produced, filmed, and broadcast on TV.

**You Try**

There’s a school dance coming up, and you have to help devise a **theme** that most of the students will enjoy. With a partner or in a small group, come up with a viable theme idea for the dance. Your viability criteria is that most students will like the theme.

Theme:

Possible decorations:

D.J. Playlist for this theme:

Viability with Writing Topics

How do you decide whether a writing topic is viable when you have to write an essay? List your criteria below:

1.
2.
3.
Examine the Writing Topic Viability Anchor Chart. How are these criteria similar to and different from yours?

**Viable Writing Topics are** ones that the writer:
- can make an argument for
- has enough to say to engage the reader
- thinks the reader will care about
- can find enough evidence to support a claim regarding
- knows will fulfill the expectations of the rubric

In this lesson, we are asking the question

*Is a particular problem you select a viable topic for a proposal essay?*

To answer this question, you have to figure out if your topic (which for this writing task is a problem with a proposed solution) can **live and grow** in the form of a proposal essay.

Now check out the Proposal Essay Topic Viability Anchor Chart.

1.) The problem is clearly defined and there is evidence of it.
2.) Potential solutions to the problem exist.
3.) The proposal has the potential to help the community.

**So the goal is to pick a problem that can fulfill the 3 criteria above.**

**Performing the Viability Test**

What does it look like when we apply these criteria to a possible proposal essay topic (problem)?

**Example Topic:** Graffiti and tagging in the downtown area

1. The problem is clearly defined and there is evidence of it.
   a. What is the specific problem?
      - Graffiti (cause) is leading to a decline in the appearance of and business in the downtown area (effects).
   
   b. What evidence do we have that this problem exists?
      - Graffiti and tags on most city blocks
      - Doesn’t get cleaned up, which encourages more graffiti and the decline of a neighborhood.
      - Several downtown shops have closed in the last year.

2. Potential solutions to the problem exist.
   - Create a volunteer graffiti clean up crew
   - Commit funds to creating a city graffiti clean up crew
   - Increase police efforts to prevent and arrest graffiti artists
   - Give graffiti artists another creative outlet—create a mural on a downtown building, get apprenticeships with local artists
   - Educate students in schools about how graffiti harms the community

3. The proposal has the potential to help the community. (Look at the current effects of the problem.)
   - Decrease crime
   - Improve the look of the downtown area
   - Less graffiti could attract new businesses
   - Citizens will feel safer about going downtown

*Is this a viable topic? YES!*

**Copyright © 2010-2014 by the Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators and Oakland Schools**
Let’s Practice

In the chart below, circle the more viable topic for a proposal essay in each pair. You may not know what the possible solutions for a problem are, but you can probably guess if you’d be able to research these solutions.

|   | 1. a. The middle school students want to change their school mascot.  
|   |   b. The dropout rate at the local high school increased by 10% last year.  
| 2. | a. A large percentage of children in Somalia (a country in Africa) are suffering from malnutrition.  
|   |   b. It’s extremely hot in Africa during the summer.  
| 3. | a. The last album by Miley Cyrus didn’t sell very well and her popularity decreased.  
|   |   b. 33% of children ages 3-17 do not have Internet access at home.  

Viability Anchor Charts

**Viable**- practical, feasible, usable, adaptable; able to live and grow.

**Writing Topic Viability**

A viable writing topic is one that the writer...

- can make an argument for.
- can find enough evidence to support a claim regarding.
- has enough to say about to engage the reader.
- thinks the reader will care about.
- knows will fulfill the expectations of the rubric.
Proposal Essay Topic Viability: 3 Criteria

The **problem** is clearly defined and there is evidence of it.

Potential **solutions** to the problem exist.

The **proposal** has the potential to help the community.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session 8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Essential Questions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How do you use questions to drive research?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How do you find information relevant to your topic on the web?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Preparation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>During this session, students will reflect on the process they undertook to land on a topic with the goal of understanding what about the brainstorming process really worked for them. Presumably, this reflection will help them with future writing tasks. The rest of the session will be spent getting ready to research. If you’ve already spent considerable time on research skills this year, you can probably skip parts of this session. Items to review and copy in preparation for this session include:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Topic Selection Reflection Handout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Driving Questions and Search Terms List Handout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Google Search Tips and Tricks Anchor Chart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <a href="http://www.google.com/support/websearch/">http://www.google.com/support/websearch/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The handouts are included after this session.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teaching Point</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal writing requires thorough research to define evidence of the problem, the problem’s causes and effects, as well as its solutions. To perform research efficiently and accurately, writers must know how to ask good questions and identify key search terms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skills:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Asking effective research questions to deepen inquiry into a problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Translating research questions into search terms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Revising search terms based on initial search results.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategies:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Practice developing research questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identify key search terms that address driving questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Produce multiple search terms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Revise search term list based on initial searches.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resources:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Internet Literacy grade 6-8 by Heather Wolpert-Gawron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Independent Practice</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Select a Topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Return the Problem Viability Notecards to your students. Ask them to select a topic based on their preferences and your feedback.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Consider allowing students to have a mini-conference with their neighbor if they need to talk through this decision. In the 6-minute mini-conference, students would explain to their parent the pros and cons of selecting either topic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Topic Selection Reflection</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Give students time to then reflect on the process of selecting a proposal topic using the Topic Selection Reflection handout.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Encourage them to write in complete sentences and use the terminology they’ve used in the unit thus far.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Active Engagement</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good Writing Comes from Good Questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduce the Teaching Point:</strong> Proposal writing requires thorough research to define evidence of the problem, the problem’s causes and effects, as well as its solutions. To perform research efficiently and accurately, writers must know how to ask good questions and identify key search terms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explain the following to your students:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Good pieces of writing explore a pressing and relevant question:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Why is the polar ice cap melting?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o What should be done about unemployment in America?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Why is Harry Potter such a popular series?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• By exploring an interesting question (implied or explicit), you further engage your reader because they want the find out answers to your question.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| • So it’s important to understand what question you think you’re trying to answer as you
research and draft any piece of writing you undertake. For your proposal essay, this question will determine what you search for as you seek information on the Internet.

**Defining Driving Questions and Search Terms**

Use the **Driving Questions and Search Terms List Handout** to walk students through developing questions for their proposal and how to pull search terms from these questions.

**Finding Answers on the Web: Effective Searching**

- If you’ve already worked with your students this year on conducting effective searches, you can skip to the next session.
- Consider modeling searches about a topic using a computer and projector to show how to search using various Google tools and how to refine your search terms based on the results you get and information you pick up from initial reading.

**Refining Your Search**

- Give students time to search on the Internet using their search terms.
- Make clear that they’re not concerned with finding the most credible sources at this point. They’re doing some more reading on their topic to discover more and better terms that will help them research their problem’s *cause, effect,* and *solutions*.
- Site Skimming tip: pay attention to headings, subheadings and terms repeated from site to site.
- Wikipedia is a good place to begin.
- End the session with students recording their revised list of search terms on the **Driving Questions and Search Terms Handout**.

**Assessment**

Collect students’ **Topic Selection Reflection** pieces as well as their **Driving Questions & Search Term List Handout**. Use the rubric below to perform a formative assessment of students’ current understanding of developing key questions and devising search terms.

**Formative Assessment Rubric – Driving Questions & Search Terms List Handout**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>On-Target</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Novice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research Questions</strong></td>
<td>- Overarching question is narrow and detailed</td>
<td>- Overarching question is narrow and detailed</td>
<td>- Overarching question adequately defines topic</td>
<td>- Overarching question is quite broad. - No sub-questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Sub-questions outline multiple causes, effects, and solutions.</td>
<td>- Sub-questions begin to define causes, effects, and solutions.</td>
<td>- No sub-questions.</td>
<td>- No sub-questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Search Terms</strong></td>
<td>Revised search terms display significant new understanding of the topic.</td>
<td>Revised search terms show new learning about the topic.</td>
<td>Revised search terms include a few new words or phrases relevant to the topic.</td>
<td>Original and revised search terms are the same.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copyright © 2010-2014 by the Michigan Association of Intermediate School Administrators and Oakland Schools
NAME___________________________________________

Topic Selection Reflection – Proposal Essay

Picking a great topic for a writing task is tough and important. Reflect on the work you’ve done generating ideas and selecting a problem to better understand what you learned during the pre-writing process.

1. When did you feel most confused during the idea generation (brainstorming) process? How come?

2. Which part of the idea generation process most helped you come up with a possible problem to write about in your proposal? Explain how/why.

3. If your topic selection process were a kind of weather, what would it be? (For example- sun showers, tornado, hurricane, tsunami, a hot cloudless day, snow.) Why?

4. Explain why you’re interested in the problem you’ve selected to write a proposal on.

5. What about this writing task still confuses you?
Driving Questions & Search Terms List

These questions will help you figure out what direction to go in as you research your topic on the Internet. They “drive” your research.

Overarching Question:
This question will most likely involve seeking a solution to your problem. Make it as specific as possible.

Example: How do we eliminate the graffiti problem in downtown Detroit?

Yours:

Questions that Define the Problem:

Cause(s)

Examples

- Who is putting up the graffiti?
- Are only certain sections of the city affected? Why?
- What happens to graffiti artists who get caught?
- How is the amount of graffiti in a city related to poverty or unemployment?

Yours:

Effect(s)

Examples

- What is the relationship between graffiti and crime/violence/drug activity?
- How does graffiti affect business in a city?
- How much time and money does it take to clean up the graffiti?

Yours:

Questions that Seek Solutions:

Examples

- How is graffiti cleaned up in Detroit?
- How is it prevented in other cities?
- Have these solutions been effective?
Your Search Terms and Phrases

1. Examine the questions you developed above. Underline all the keywords and phrases that appear in them.
2. Use these words/phrases to start your list below.
3. Next, add any other words to your search terms and phrases that you believe could be relevant to your topic.
4. Finally, while performing some initial research, revise your list to reflect the new words and phrases you’ve discovered that are important to your topic, and cross off any items that you have decided won’t uncover important information.

Example

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Detroit graffiti</th>
<th>Effects of graffiti (in Detroit)</th>
<th>Solutions to graffiti in cities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tagging</td>
<td>Relationship between graffiti and crime/drug activity</td>
<td>How to clean up graffiti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graffiti artists</td>
<td>Cost of cleaning up graffiti</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punishment for graffiti in Michigan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graffiti and poverty/unemployment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Yours:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Finding Answers From Credible Sources</th>
<th>Session 9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Essential Question</td>
<td>How do you know if a source is credible?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation</td>
<td>Review the Credible Sources Anchor Chart. Select web sources that will help you illustrate each of the items on the chart. Here are some possibilities:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Website: <a href="http://www.unwater.org/">http://www.unwater.org/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>No author but credible sponsoring institution-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Credible author: <a href="http://www.time.com/time/world/article/0,8599,1890623,00.html">http://www.time.com/time/world/article/0,8599,1890623,00.html</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make copies of the Web Source Credibility Chart. Using the same topic you used to model research skills during yesterday’s session, select 3-5 sources that vary in their levels of credibility. Have them ready to share with students for evaluation by putting the links on your website or emailing them to your students. Examples using graffiti as the topic/problem:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High credibility: <a href="http://www.toronto.ca/graffiti/abatement_program.htm">http://www.toronto.ca/graffiti/abatement_program.htm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Point</td>
<td>Writers must take a trial and error approach with research as they find sources, determine their credibility, gain new knowledge about their topic, and further define the information and evidence they must gather. The credibility of sources can be determined by type of source, author, sponsoring institution, and cross-referencing facts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Skills:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Determining the credibility of web sources based on URLs, authors, and cross-referencing facts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Using an Internet search engine to perform research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Strategies:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provide students with 3-5 sources on the same topic and have them evaluate their credibility based on a specified list of components.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Practice searching and refining terms based on search engine results.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Have students search and select one credible and one non-credible source about their problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resource</td>
<td><em>Internet Literacy grade 6-8</em> by Heather Wolpert-Gawron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active Engagement</td>
<td>Optional: Using Evernote.com</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>As your students embark on collecting research for their proposals, Evernote.com is a fantastic place for them to keep and organize their findings. If your students don’t already use this web-based platform and would like to, provide a 10 minute intro to Evernote, explaining</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• the purpose and benefits of Evernote</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• how to save text and image from the web</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• how to organize it into notebooks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What Makes a Source Credible?</td>
<td><strong>Introduce the Teaching Point:</strong> Writers must take a trial and error approach with research as they find sources, determine their credibility, gain new knowledge about their topic, and further define</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the information and evidence they must gather. The credibility of sources can be determined by type of source, author, sponsoring institution, and cross-referencing facts.

Review the Credible Sources Anchor Chart with students using sample sites, blogs, and wikis to illustrate the aspects of a web source they should examine to determine their credibility.

Rating Sources Based on Credibility
Set Up
This activity is ideally done in a computer lab or with students at classroom computer stations or on their laptops. They will be performing research on their own later in the class period, so having computer access all period long is ideal. If you don’t have access to that many computers, another option is to use a single computer with a projector and to do this as a full class activity.

Activity
Put your students in groups of 4-5 students. Present the class with 3-5 sources about the same topic. (You could throw in a source that is credible but not relevant and see what they do with it—just for a little challenge.)

Have students evaluate the credibility of the web sources using the Web Source Credibility Chart.

Full Class Share and Discussion
Have the class share their results. Any easy way to do this is to have groups record their rankings on a chart on the board (see below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group 1</th>
<th>Group 2</th>
<th>Group 3</th>
<th>Group 4</th>
<th>Group 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Source A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Have the class assess which sources were consistently considered most and least credible. Discuss why groups gave sources the ratings they did.

Independent Practice
Students Search for and Save Sources
Give students time to search for sources about their chosen topic and decide whether these sources are credible. All possible sources can be saved in Evernote.com or their bookmarks.

Assessment
Circulate throughout the class period and ask students to share the credible sources they’ve found. Also ask them to share/describe a source they discovered that they deemed not credible and explain why.

As a form of reflection, in the last 5 minutes of class, consider having your students explain to their neighbor why they selected particular sources and discarded others. Having to articulate these decisions to someone else clarifies thinking and can raise questions that need to be addressed as a class. Allow time for such questions that all students would benefit from hearing the answers to.
Credible Sources Anchor Chart

How do you know if a Web source is credible? Look at these 5 components:

**Type of Source** – web site, blog or wiki?
- **Website** - more static so the information doesn’t change over time. Look at who the sponsoring institution is.
- **Blog** - can provide good information, but you must know who the author is and whether s/he is an expert/reliable source.
- **Wiki** - authored and edited by multiple people. Determine who they are and what their purpose and expertise is.

**Sponsoring Institution** – the company, organization, or university/college who sponsors this site
- Different institutions have different reasons for providing information. Consider their purpose before using a site’s information.
- Examine the URL (web address) to determine the purpose of the site
  - .com – commercial> to sell services
  - .gov – government institution> to inform the public
  - .edu – educational institution> to share research
  - .org – non-profit organization
  - .net - network

**Author** – the writer of the page or article
- What are this person’s credentials?
- Is s/he an expert on this subject?

**Cross-Referencing Facts**
- Compare the facts from this source to a credible source. Do they match up?
### Web Source Credibility Chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Credibility Rank</th>
<th>Source A Name</th>
<th>Type of Source</th>
<th>Sponsoring Institution &amp; URL</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Cross-Referencing Facts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Credibility Rank</th>
<th>Source B Name</th>
<th>Type of Source</th>
<th>Sponsoring Institution &amp; URL</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Cross-Referencing Facts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Credibility Rank</th>
<th>Source C Name</th>
<th>Type of Source</th>
<th>Sponsoring Institution &amp; URL</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Cross-Referencing Facts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Credibility Rank</th>
<th>Source D Name</th>
<th>Type of Source</th>
<th>Sponsoring Institution &amp; URL</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Cross-Referencing Facts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility Rank</td>
<td>Source E Name</td>
<td>Type of Source</td>
<td>Sponsoring Institution &amp; URL</td>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Cross-Referencing Facts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Session 10

#### Essential Questions
- Once you have a credible source, what do you do with it?
- How do you paraphrase evidence for use in a text?

#### Preparation
Select a short article or part of an article about a community problem that requires a solution. You will use the article to show students how to sift and sort information when researching.

**Prepare copies of:**
- *Quoting, Paraphrasing, and Summarizing* handout
- *7 Steps to Effective Paraphrasing* Anchor Chart
  Both are included after this session.

#### Teaching Point
Once a writer has collected multiple credible sources, s/he must decide what information from each source is relevant and how it will be used in the proposal. This requires the writer to categorize source information based on the parts of a proposal and how the information will act as evidence for a particular component of the piece. Paraphrasing is one way to present key information from a credible source.

**Skills:**
- Reading sources for information relevant to research questions.
- Categorizing information based on the components of a proposal.
- Paraphrasing relevant passages from credible sources.

**Strategies:**
- Categorize the information into problem definition, cause, effect, or solution.
- Practice reading a source and pulling out relevant information for a specified community problem and its accompanying research questions.
- Have students practice this process using a source for their chosen community problem.
- Practice paraphrasing a key passage from a source.

#### Active Engagement
**Sifting and Sorting**

**Introduce the Teaching Point:** Once a writer has collected multiple credible sources, s/he must decide what information from each source is relevant and how it will be used in the proposal. This requires the writer to categorize source information based on the parts of a proposal and how the information will act as evidence for a particular component of the piece.

- Introduce an article or part of an article that you will read together as a class to sift and sort the information.
- Provide the students with the driving questions for the research on this topic.
- Read through the article paragraph-by-paragraph using a projector (or have the students do this in groups and revisit as a full class) and highlight relevant information into the following categories.

  **Categories of information**
  - Cause - green
  - Effect - red
  - Evidence of the Problem - yellow
  - Solutions - blue

- Have students put a star next to the passages that they determine to be the most relevant and important based on the research questions you’ve provided them.
- Show students how they can then paste the best passages of a particular color into a note in Evernote or into a section of a Word document to group like information together.
- Note the importance of keeping track of source information so sources can be cited.
- Discuss to Learn
  - Were there many types/colors of information in this article/section? Why or why not?
  - How did you decide what was most important from the article that you would want to use in a proposal?
  - What would a next step be once you had read and categorized information from all your sources? (Discuss re-ordering the info in each category/color.)

**What Is Paraphrasing and How Do You Do It?**

**Introduce the Teaching Point:** Paraphrasing is one way to present key information from a credible source.
First, take your students through the Quoting, Paraphrasing, and Summarizing handout, which discusses the difference between the three and shows a paraphrased example.

Next, explain the 7 Steps for Paraphrasing Anchor Chart.

Return to the Quoting, Paraphrasing, and Summarizing Handout and paraphrase the selected passage either in small groups or as a full class. Alternately, use a passage from the article the class just read. Have the students discuss their word choice, organization, and cutting of phrases and sentences in their final paraphrase.

**Independent Practice**

**Practice Paraphrasing**

- Have your students select a passage from one of their sources that they would like to paraphrase.
- On one side of a large notecard or half a sheet of paper, have students record the following:
  - Their chosen problem for the proposal
  - A verbatim quote from a credible source that they deem important for their proposal
  - Source information
- On the other side of the notecard/paper, have students
  - Paraphrase the quotation
  - Explain why/how this quotation is important to their proposal.
    - What section does it belong in? (general purpose)
    - What driving question does it address? (more specific purpose)

**Assessment**

Review the students’ practice with paraphrasing using the rubric below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paraphrasing</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>On-target</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Novice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Selects key points, uses new word choice, organization of ideas, and sentence structure.</td>
<td>Selects key points, uses new word choice, organization of ideas, or sentence structure.</td>
<td>Selects some key points but struggles to generate new word choice, sentence structure or organization.</td>
<td>Struggles to identify key points and/or alter word choice, sentence structure and organization.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Explanation | | Identifies purpose of quote. Discusses in detail the relevance of the quote to a driving question. |
|-------------| | Identifies purpose of quote. Connects quote to driving question. |
| | | Identifies either the purpose of the quote or the driving question it connects to. |
| | | Unsure of quote’s purpose and related driving question. |
Quoting and Paraphrasing Handout

How Is Paraphrasing Different from Summarizing?

**Quotations** must be identical to the original and use only a small passage from the source. They must match the source document word for word and must be attributed to the original author.

**Paraphrasing** involves putting a passage from a source into your own words. A paraphrase must also be attributed to the original source. Paraphrased material is usually shorter than the original passage because it condenses the original passage.

**Summarizing** involves putting the main idea(s) into your own words, including only the main point(s). Once again, it is necessary to give credit for the summarized ideas to the original source. Summaries are significantly shorter than the original because they take a broad overview of the source.

**Sample Paraphrase**


**Original Passage**

“While the world’s population tripled in the 20th century, the use of renewable water resources has grown six-fold. Within the next fifty years, the world population will increase by another 40 to 50%. This population growth - coupled with industrialization and urbanization - will result in an increasing demand for water and will have serious consequences on the environment.”

**Weak Paraphrase of Passage – What makes it weak?**

The number of people in the world tripled in the 20th century, but the use of renewable water resources has grown six-fold. In fifty years, the world population will grow by another 40 to 50%. This growth will result in an increasing demand for water and will have serious consequences on the environment.

**Good Paraphrase of Passage – What makes it good?**

Subject, purpose, importance: evidence of the problem, causes (population growth and increased water use)

The world water crisis is a result of population growth and using more “renewable water resources.” There are three times more people living on the planet than there were a century ago, using six times more water. This massive water usage spells trouble for the environment, especially because the global population is expected to grow by 40-50% in the next fifty years. ([www.watercouncil.org](http://www.watercouncil.org))

**You Try!**


“According to the **United Nations**, every day 4,400 children under the age of 5 die around the world, having fallen sick because of unclean water and sanitation. In fact, five times as many children die each year of diarrhea as of HIV/AIDS. A third of the world’s population is enduring some form of water scarcity. One in every six human beings has no access to clean water within a kilometer of their homes. Half of all people in
developing countries have no access to proper sanitation. Water is critical for life and for livelihoods. Yet billions of people suffer from disease, poverty and a lack of dignity and opportunity because they have no access to this basic resource.”

Subject, purpose, importance:

Your paraphrase:
7 Steps for Paraphrasing

1. **Reread** the original passage multiple times to determine what it means.

2. **Put away** the original passage.

3. **Write** your paraphrase on a note card, in a Word document or in another online research tool.
   - change the order of ideas
   - change the structure of sentences
   - use synonyms for key words

4. **Title** your paraphrase with key words or phrases to indicate the **subject, purpose, and importance** of your paraphrase.

5. **Check** your paraphrase against the original passage to make sure that your version accurately expresses all the important information.

6. **Put quotation marks** around any terms or phrases you lifted exactly from the source.

7. **Record the citation information** below the paraphrase so you can create a parenthetic citation or endnote if you use this information in your piece.
### Session 11

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- How do you write a problem statement for a proposal?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- How do you determine your audience for a proposal?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- How does audience affect tone and diction?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Teaching Point

Proposals must have clear statements of the problem that outline the cause(s) and effect(s). The language a writer uses will vary depending on who his/her audience is.

**Skills:**
- Devise a problem statement.
- Determine the primary and secondary audiences for a proposal.

**Strategies:**
- Model problem statements for community-based problems.
- Define proposal audience: the person/people who can solve or assist in solving the problem.
- Model differences in language depending on audience using one of the model problem statements.
- Based on their initial research, students define who the primary and secondary audiences are that can solve the problem or assist with the solution.
- Students draft problem statements for their intended audience defining their problem’s cause(s) and effect(s).

### Session 12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- How do you draft to define cause and effect?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- How do you incorporate your research into a draft?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Teaching Point

The first half of a proposal must define the problem and explore cause and effect to provide evidence of the problem. This persuades the audience of the seriousness and implications of the problem. Incorporating research into a proposal involves paraphrasing and/or quoting sources. This evidence from outside sources strengthens the argument of the proposal.

**Skills:**
- Articulating cause and effect.
- Paraphrasing, quoting, and using proper citation format.
- Connecting information found in research to a specific point in a proposal.

**Strategies:**
- Review the parts of a proposal.
- Explain how to incorporate a quotation – lead-in sentence, quotation format, analysis/explanation.
- Encourage students to begin drafting to define cause and effect by using the question: How do we know this problem exists?
- Provide a strategy for how to incorporate evidence found during the research phase. Students should have the research they put in the cause and effect categories close at hand.
### Session 13

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential Questions</th>
<th>How do you draft a solution?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teaching Point</strong></td>
<td>The solution portion of a proposal essay can be multi-part or offer multiple solutions to address all the effects of the problem. Giving evidence of how other people/communities have employed similar solutions gives a writer’s argument more credibility.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Skills:**         | - Articulating a multi-part solution.  
                      - Explaining why a proposed solution is feasible.  
                      - Paraphrasing, quoting, and using proper citation format.  
                      - Connecting information found in research to a specific point in a proposal. |
| **Strategies:**     | - Revisit what makes a solution feasible.  
                      - Reinforce the benefits of providing multi-part or multiple solutions that address all the effects of the problem by revisiting a model.  
                      - Revisit paraphrasing and quoting from sources as needed. |

### Session 14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential Questions</th>
<th>How do you revise a rough draft?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teaching Point</strong></td>
<td>After writers complete a draft, they revisit what they have written to see if it makes sense, needs to be re-organized and addresses the target audience. Revision is essential to good writing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Skills:**         | - Analyze two versions of the same text (preferably a sample proposal) and identify differences.  
                      - Determine how changes to a draft improve an argument. |
| **Strategies:**     | - Compare an early and a finalized draft of the same proposal. Have students identify/highlight the differences in the draft. Look at:  
                      - o Content  
                      - o Structure  
                      - o Diction and style  
                      - Discuss how the changes improve the final draft. |

### Session 15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential Questions</th>
<th>How do you provide effective feedback to a peer about a proposal?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teaching Point</strong></td>
<td>Writers ask for constructive criticism from other writers in order to determine how to best revise their pieces. This feedback can come from peers who carefully and respectfully critique another student’s writing. This feedback is then used to revise the piece to improve on content, organization, and argumentation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Skills:**         | - Praise effective aspects of another writer’s proposal.  
                      - Identify issues with the argument, content and structure in another student’s work. |
| **Strategies:**     | - Define helpful and respectful feedback.  
                      - Perform a role-play or play a video to illustrate constructive and unconstructive feedback.  
                      - Students pair up and read each other’s proposals and give feedback using a critiquing handout as a guideline.  
                      - Have students devise a revision plan based on the feedback received. |
### Session 16 and 17

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essential Questions</th>
<th>How do you revise a rough draft?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Teaching Point**  | After writers complete a draft, they revisit what they have written to see if it makes sense, needs to be re-organized and addresses the target audience. Revision is essential to good writing. Conferencing with another writer or the teacher can be helpful in devising and carrying out a revision plan. **Skills:**  
  - Explain the concept of a revision plan.  
  - Articulate questions or struggles with the assignment that the teacher can address in conference. **Strategies:**  
  - Conference with students in small groups or individually depending on what time and class size allows.  
  - Students use independent work time to revise and perform additional research as needed. |

### Session 18

| Essential Questions | What is the difference between drafting, revision, and editing?  
What steps were effective and ineffective for you during this writing process? |
|---------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|
| **Teaching Point**  | The last step that writers take before sending off a piece of writing is to edit it to catch all the small grammatical errors. Small grammatical and punctuation errors can trip a reader up, making your argument less clear. Reflecting on the writing process helps writers refine their process for future writing projects. **Skills:**  
  - Distinguish between revision and editing.  
  - Identify particular grammatical and formatting issues in one’s own and other students’ writing.  
  - Reflect on the writing process. **Strategies:**  
  - Review key editing points.  
  - Have students edit and peer edit (as time allows).  
  - Read a sample reflection piece and discuss what students are expected to include in their own reflection pieces. |

| Post-Unit Assessment | Students turn in their final proposals as the post-unit assessment. |